To: Dustin Anderson – Town Manager

From: Stephen Gunty – Director of Public Works

Date: August 3, 2020

Re: Tree Services Quote

Our previous tree services contractor withdrew from their contract awarded in March so quotes for the removal of trees and stumps in addition to tree pruning, debris removal and emergency tree work were solicited from 15 contractors via email on May 22 with 3 quotes received, as follows: 1) Dave's Tree Service, Inc. (Munster, IN), 2) Pro Tree Services (Mokena, IL) and 3) Davey Tree Expert Co. (Mokena, IL).

Some of the contract expectations and highlights include:

- contractor shall be called to perform tree work services on an as-needed basis.
- contractor must be on call on a 24 hour, 7 days a week, 365 days a year basis for any emergency situations with a required response time within two (2) hours of call-out.
- work not accomplished within a two-week period of time once scheduled excluding emergencies will be considered an unreasonable response.
- tree removals must be completed within 48 hours from the beginning of work by contractor unless otherwise agreed upon in writing.
- contractor billing is preferred monthly but not to exceed 2 months.
- contractor must have or obtain a valid contractor's license from the Town of Munster.

For purpose of scoring we placed emphasis on the size trees we're most likely to contract out as the Town cuts most of the smaller and less technically difficult trees. Tree & stump removal prices were quoted in a unit price format based on actual tree size serviced. Tree pruning & debris removal prices were quoted based on an hourly crew rate with an after-hours emergency callout rate also cited. The largest expected expense will be tree & stump removal.

To help make the needed comparison for an award decision, the 2 categories of tree removal and stump removal were reduced to one estimated lump sum dollar cost based on last year's actual experience (namely… 46 trees cut and 60 stumps removed). While the actual Quotes are provided, the projected 2020 expenses are shown in this BID COMPARISON CHART for ease of comparison.

QUOTE COMPARISON CHART (projected 2020 $-cost derived from 2019 actual experience)

Contractor	Dave's Tree Service	Pro Tree Services	Davey Tree Expert
Tree Removal			
Based on 46 trees =	*35,620*	*37,071*	*90,280*
Stump Removal			
Based on 60 stumps =	*10,005*	*9,000*	*13,935*
SUBTOTAL	**45,625**	**46,071**	**104,215**
Tree Pruning Rate / hr			
Based on crew of 3 =	*425*	*300*	*270*
Debris Removal Rate / hr			
Based on crew of 2 =	*350*	*400*	*180*
SUBTOTAL	**775**	**700**	**550**
Emergency Call-out Rate			
Multiplier factor =	*1.5*	*2.0*	*1.5*

Methodology:

Bids were analyzed with primary focus on the 2 major predictable cost areas, namely Tree Removal and Stump Removal, but also considering Tree Pruning, Debris Removal and the Emergency Call-out Rate.

Davey Tree Expert has higher pricing in the 2 major areas. The remaining two are quite close in the 2 major areas: Dave's Tree Service @ $45,625 and Pro Tree Services @ $46,071. This is not a material difference since these are hypothetical annual costs based on projected quantities. The Tree Pruning Rate is won by Pro Tree Services and the Debris Removal Rate by Dave's Tree Service.

Dave's Tree Service has the more favorable Emergency Call-out Rate @ 1.5 versus 2.0 for Pro Tree Services. If the decision were strictly monetary, the advantage is toward Dave's Tree Service. Factoring in past complaints about Dave's Tree Service, the advantage slants toward Pro Tree Services.

Recommendation:

By motion and voice vote authorize the acceptance the Pro Tree Services proposal